



MINUTES FROM
NOVEMBER 19, 2023, SUNDAY
REDWOOD STOA GROUP MEETING
MET ONLINE USING ZOOM
10:00AM–12:00PM PT

Attendees: Larry, Simon, John, Stan, David, Li, Gerry, Michael B., Niyant, Takako, Andrey, Dawn
This month's theme: *Gratitude*

Open discussion on:

- Whether to expect gratitude from others
 - Paying back a virtuous deed with gratitude
- Being grateful for modern advancements, and the world as is it is, and to Stoicism
- Practicing gratitude during early childhood
- Social contracts and what is in our own control
- Pessimism that leads to automatic gratitude for when things go right
- Preferring preferred indifferents
- Being grateful as a way to be less selfish and more interconnected

Stoic practice

- Simon has courageously left an organization that he had been intemperately leading.
- Stan has been implementing the wisdom of the dichotomy of control.
- Larry has been accepting that bad car drivers are out of his control.
- Michael B. recognized that future medical results were out of his control.
- Niyant subscribed to a program that offsets carbon emissions.
- David has been eating less meat.
- Gerry has been justly financially sponsoring a family for Christmas.
- Takako has been grateful to find a good medical facility for her mother.
- Andrey has been courageous in the face of government bureaucracy.

Reports and Announcements:

- The Stoic Fellowship — Globally Connected – Locally Engaged
 - <http://www.stoicfellowship.com/>
- Fremont Stoics
 - <https://www.meetup.com/fremont-stoics/>
- MeetUp fees are \$200/year (Apr & Oct). Thank you to those who have donated!

Group goals achieved:

- We met!



Next Month's Meeting:

- Next meeting will be in Virtual Space, on **December 17, 2023**
- Next month's theme: **Social by Nature**

Zoom Meeting Chat Log:

10:08:45 From Simon To Everyone:

Redwood Stoa Jargon List Link>>>

[https://docs.google.com/document/d/1-](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1-rqb3he7uoBsk6KtjHgoqFuFwDvilzGORK8E1hdR9Yw/edit?usp=sharing)

[rqb3he7uoBsk6KtjHgoqFuFwDvilzGORK8E1hdR9Yw/edit?usp=sharing](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1-rqb3he7uoBsk6KtjHgoqFuFwDvilzGORK8E1hdR9Yw/edit?usp=sharing)

10:08:47 From John Knighton To Everyone:

This appears too be Amanda's website.

[https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=2ahUKEwiQuN3m09CCAxWQiO4BHRi_BsIQ-](https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=2ahUKEwiQuN3m09CCAxWQiO4BHRi_BsIQ-TAoAHoFCNoBEAE&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.knoxrobinson.com%2F&usg=AOvVaw1_XQJ6fCbzb0ycdqs0uwP6&opi=89978449)

[TAoAHoFCNoBEAE&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.knoxrobinson.com%2F&usg=AOvVaw1_XQJ6fCbzb0ycdqs0uwP6&opi=89978449](https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=2ahUKEwiQuN3m09CCAxWQiO4BHRi_BsIQ-TAoAHoFCNoBEAE&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.knoxrobinson.com%2F&usg=AOvVaw1_XQJ6fCbzb0ycdqs0uwP6&opi=89978449)

10:12:08 From Michael B To Everyone:

JAN - Rational by Nature

FEB - Judgment & Assent

MAR - Desire & Aversion

APR - What is in our Power

MAY - Temperance

JUN - Fortitude

JUL - Justice

AUG - Wisdom

SEP - Reflection (HCR Library)

OCT - Living in Accordance with Nature (Tilden)

NOV - Gratitude

DEC - Social by Nature

10:18:35 From Gerald Castellino To Everyone:

beautiful

10:26:00 From John Knighton To Everyone:

YOU - Wm Irvine

<https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=2ahUKEwjekfHs19CCAxUuJEQIHVwUBiEQFnoECCMQAQ&url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.amazon.com%2FYou-Natural-William-B-Irvine%2Fdp%2F0190869194&usg=AOvVaw0HSwBABXO52qAmv7APr2f8&opi=89978449>

10:51:36 From Larry Berger To Everyone:



Our situation is like that at a festival. Sheep and cattle are driven to it to be sold, and most people come either to buy or to sell, while only a few come to look at the spectacle of the festival, to see how it is proceeding and why, and who is organizing it, and for what purpose. So also in this festival of the world. Some people are like sheep and cattle and are interested in nothing but their fodder; for in the case of those of you who are interested in nothing but your property, and land, and slaves, and public posts, all of that is nothing more than fodder. Few indeed are those who attend the fair for love of the spectacle, asking, 'What is the universe, then, and who governs it? No one at all? (Discourses 2.14.23-25)

10:56:12 From Dawn Martin To Everyone:

Reacted to "Our situation is lik..." with ❤️

11:10:29 From Dawn Martin To Everyone:

ChatGPT: Stoics and Gratitude
gratitude, inherently promotes it.

Stoicism, though not explicitly discussing modern
Key aspects:

Appreciation of What One Has: Stoics emphasize being thankful for current circumstances and focusing on essentials like health and virtue.

Negative Visualization: Imagining the loss of something valuable to appreciate it more deeply.

Acceptance of External Events: Seeing challenges as opportunities for growth, leading to a form of gratitude.

Focus on Virtue and Character: Gratitude in Stoicism is more about internal moral strengths than external gains.

Community and Interconnectedness: Recognizing and being thankful for the support and roles within a community.

Emotional Resilience: Using gratitude to maintain a balanced perspective, especially during hardship.

Mindfulness of the Present: Appreciating the current moment, rather than dwelling on the past or future.

11:15:41 From Larry Berger To Everyone:

ChatGPT looks good, except maybe remove "health" from "focusing on essentials like health and virtue"; it's important but not a virtue.

11:16:38 From Dawn Martin To Everyone:

Reacted to "ChatGPT looks good, ..." with 👍

11:25:04 From Dawn Martin To Everyone:

You have morals and empathy

11:42:04 From dave To Everyone:



When you wake up in the morning, tell yourself: The people I deal with today will be meddling, ungrateful, arrogant, dishonest, jealous and surly. They are like this because they cannot tell good from evil. But I have seen the beauty of good, and the ugliness of evil, and have recognized that the wrongdoer has a nature related to my own - not of the same blood or birth, but the same mind, and possessing a share of the divine. And so none of them can hurt me. No one can implicate me in ugliness. Nor can I feel angry at my relative, or hate him. We were born to work together like feet, hands and eyes, like the two rows of teeth, upper and lower. To obstruct each other is unnatural. To feel anger at someone, to turn your back on him: these are obstructions.

11:42:42 From Larry Berger To Everyone:

Reacted to "When you wake up in ..." with 👍

11:45:11 From Niyant Krishnamurthi To Everyone:

<https://www.wren.co/>

11:50:25 From Larry Berger To Everyone:

Set aside a certain number of days, during which you shall be content with the scantiest and cheapest fare, with coarse and rough dress, saying to yourself the while: 'Is this the condition that I feared?' (Seneca, Letters to Lucilius, XVIII.5)

11:50:39 From Larry Berger To Everyone:

Modern Stoics also interpret the famous self-deprivation exercises [and neg vis] as, in part, having to do with gratitude: reset the so-called hedonic treadmill

11:51:19 From Dawn Martin To Everyone:

Reacted to "Modern Stoics also i..." with 👍

12:00:39 From Dawn Martin To Everyone:

I need to drop thanks

12:01:25 From Gerald Castellino To Everyone:

Got to drop - thanks all !

>>>

Join the Redwood Stoa! Now you can become an official member of the Redwood Stoa by adding your name through the following web form: <https://redwoodstoa.wordpress.com/join-the-redwood-stoa/>

It's pleasant to do and will help the group effectively plan future events! Follow us too!